

1 HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING: City of  
2 Pontiac, on Tuesday, April 10, 2018; Pontiac City Hall,  
3 47450 Woodward Avenue, Pontiac, Michigan 48342

4  
5 COMMISSIONERS: Chair Rick David  
6 Co-Chair Robert Karazim  
7 Linda Porter  
8 Ken Burch  
9 Kathie Henk

10 FROM THE CITY: Arthur Mullen, City Planner

11 CHAIRMAN DAVID CALLED THE MEETING TO ORDER AT 6:06 P.M.

12 ROLL CALL:

13 PRESENT: Chair David, Comm. Karazim, Comm. Porter

14 Mr. Mullen reported a quorum present.

15 ARRIVED LATE: Comm. Burch, Comm. Henk

16 COMMUNICATION: Mr. Mullen informed the Commission that  
17 he has written a letter to 202 Cherokee in regards to  
18 the fact that they started building a porch and the City  
19 put a Stop Work Order on it and they informed the owner  
20 that they would have to go before this Commission before  
21 work can proceed. He also wanted to make sure the  
22 Commission was amicable to granting permission to build  
23 an addition if it is properly designed. He and  
24 Mr. Bullis from an upcoming case felt it would improve  
25 the flatness of the front of the house. The resident  
said they would be able to do that in April and they did  
not file an application to do so.

MINUTES FOR REVIEW: 3-13-18

COMM. HENK MOTIONED TO APPROVE

COMM. KARAZIM SECONDED.

VOTE: AYES: Comm. David, Comm. Karazim,  
Comm. Porter, Comm. Henk

NAYS: None

1 ABSTAIN: None.

2 Vote 4-0-0 motion carries.

3 PRESERVATION PLANNER'S REPORT RELATIVE TO THE  
4 REPLACEMENT OF ALUMINUM SIDING:

4

HDC 18-05

5

PROPERTY ADDRESS: 34 Henry Clay

6

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Franklin Boulevard Historic District

7

PARCEL NO.: 64-14-29-359-010

8

APPLICANT: River Home Remodeling Group  
Rep: David Dettmer

9

10 OWNER: Karen Tolliver

11 Presentation of facts given by Mr. Mullen.

12 COMM. KARAZIM STATED THAT ONCE UPON A TIME THE WHOLE  
13 NEIGHBORHOOD GOT TOGETHER AND VOTED YES TO PRESERVE THIS  
14 NEIGHBORHOOD AND KEEP IT THE WAY IT ORIGINALLY WAS AND  
15 THAT ALUMINUM SIDING DOES NOT FIT NOR DOES VINYL.

14

Ms. Tolliver indicated that the house had aluminum  
15 siding on it when she bought it in 1985.

16 COMM. KARAZIM TOLD MS. TOLLIVER THAT WHEN SHE TAKES OFF  
17 THAT SIDING SHE WILL HAVE TO FIX WHAT'S THERE.

17

Ms. Tolliver indicated that she knows the wood  
18 underneath is rotting.

19 COMM. KARAZIM STATED THAT IF THE WOOD IS ROTTING YOU  
20 JUST REPLACE IT.

20

COMM. BURCH STATED THAT IN THE PAST THE COMMISSION HAS  
21 ALLOWED PEOPLE TO REPLACE SIDING AS LONG AS THE  
22 REPLACEMENT SIDING IS THE SAME SIZE.

22

COMM. KARAZIM INDICATED THAT THEY'VE ALLOWED REPLACEMENT  
23 WITH HARDIE BOARD THE SAME SIZE BUT NEVER ALUMINUM OR  
24 VINYL.

24

COMM. BURCH INDICATED THAT IT WAS A LONG TIME AGO.

25

1 THE CHAIRPERSON INDICATED THAT THE ORIGINAL BOARD IS A  
2 THIN PROFILE.

3 Mr. Dettmer stated that no one knows what's underneath  
4 the aluminum.

5 COMM. HENK INDICATED THAT THE COMMISSION HAS NEVER  
6 APPROVED ALUMINUM OR VINYL.

7 COMM. BURCH STATED THAT IT HAS YEARS AGO.

8 COMM. HENK AFFIRMED BUT SAID THAT IT WAS BEFORE THE  
9 CURRENT BOARD WAS ON.

10 COMM. BURCH DESCRIBED A HOME THAT THEY DID ALLOW VINYL  
11 REPLACEMENT.

12 Mr. Dettmer provided the Commission with a tablet to  
13 view about 35 pictures.

14 COMM. KARAZIM INQUIRED OF THE HOMEOWNER IF A PICTURE WAS  
15 HER HOME.

16 Ms. Tolliver affirmed.

17 COMM. KARAZIM ASKED HER IF IT IS YELLOW.

18 Ms. Tolliver affirmed.

19 COMM. KARAZIM STATED THAT AT SOME POINT THE ALUMINUM  
20 WENT ON HER HOME.

21 Ms. Tolliver affirmed and said it had to be in the 1970s  
22 or 1980s.

23 COMM. HENK ASKED IF ANYBODY HAS SEEN UNDERNEATH THE  
24 ALUMINUM.

25 Mr. Dettmer stated that they don't want to pull a panel  
off to look because, putting it back, it would never  
look the same.

COMM. BURCH INQUIRED OF THE APPLICANT WHAT SHE WANTED TO  
REPLACE THE ALUMINUM WITH.

Ms. Tolliver indicated a cream color.

Mr. Dettmer stated that it is a pearl color.

1 COMM. KARAZIM INDICATED THAT THE PORCH PROBABLY WASN'T  
2 ORIGINALLY ENCLOSED.

2

3 Mr. Dettmer agreed, then stated that the vinyl material  
4 they want to replace it with is the best in the industry  
5 and has a lifetime warranty, it's fully backed,  
6 insulated, not going to fade and can withstand 160 mph  
7 winds. He also stated that the color Ms. Tolliver chose  
8 will look elegant with white trim and much better than  
9 the current yellow. He then indicated that you can only  
10 imagine how many nails went into the original wood and  
11 that it would take a whole lot to restore it.

7

8 COMM. BURCH INQUIRED IF THE PROPOSED SIDING WAS THE SAME  
9 WIDTH AS WHAT'S CURRENTLY THERE.

10 Mr. Dettmer said it is not and would be thinner, 6  
11 inches. He then stated that the only way to go back to  
12 8 inches would be with aluminum.

13 THE CHAIRPERSON INQUIRED IF THE PROPOSED WOULD THEN BE  
14 MORE IN LINE WITH THE WIDTH OF THE ORIGINAL WOOD.

12

13 COMM. BURCH INQUIRED WHAT THE WIDTH OF THE ORIGINAL WOOD  
14 IS.

15 Mr. Dettmer answered that they don't know.

16 THE CHAIRPERSON STATED THAT IT IS PROBABLY 3 1/2 INCHES.

17 COMM. BURCH STATED THAT IT WOULD THEN BE CLOSER TO THE  
18 ORIGINAL AND EXPRESSED CONCERN THAT, IF IT WAS ALREADY  
19 NONCONTRIBUTING WITH THE ALUMINUM AND THIS IS CLOSER TO  
20 THE SIZE OF THE ORIGINAL BUT THAT THE VINYL IS  
21 NONCONTRIBUTING.

22 THE CHAIRPERSON STATED THAT CONTRIBUTING GOES BY THE  
23 YEAR THE HOUSE WAS BUILT. HE THEN ASKED WHAT YEAR THE  
24 HOME WAS BUILT.

25 COMM. KARAZIM ANSWERED PROBABLY 1910 TO 1920. HE THEN  
SAID TO COMM. BURCH THAT THEY HAVE TOLD 50 PEOPLE THAT  
THEY CAN'T REPLACE WITH VINYL AND NOW HE WANTS TO DO SO.

23 COMM. BURCH STATED THAT HE IS SAYING THAT THEY SHOULD  
24 AND ASKED IF GOING FROM ALUMINUM TO VINYL WOULD DETRACT.

24

25 COMM. KARAZIM STATED THAT THE BOARD, FOR THE LAST FIVE OR  
SIX YEARS SINCE THEY CURRENT BOARD WAS IN PLACE, HAS SET

1 A PRECEDENCE AND THAT THEY WOULD HAVE TO GO BACK TO  
2 EVERYONE THAT THEY TOLD THEY CAN'T DO IT AND ADVISE  
THEM THAT THEY CAN NOW.

3 COMM. BURCH STATED THAT THE COMMISSION COULD ALWAYS  
4 CHANGE.

5 THE CHAIR INQUIRED OF COMM. PORTER IF SHE HAD ANY  
6 FEEDBACK.

7 COMM. PORTER INDICATED THAT SHE IS TORN WITH THE TRACK  
8 RECORD THAT THE COMMISSION HAS ESTABLISHED.

9 COMM. BURCH APOLOGIZED FOR BEING LATE AND INQUIRED IF  
10 THEY COULD GET ANY DIRECTION FROM LANSING BECAUSE YOU  
11 HAVE A HOMEOWNER HERE WHO HAS LIVED IN HER HOME 33 YEARS  
12 AND WANTS TO BEAUTIFY HER HOME AND THAT, IF NOT VINYL,  
13 THEY SHOULD BE ABLE TO COME UP WITH SOMETHING ELSE.

14 COMM. KARAZIM STATED THAT THEY DID COME UP WITH HARDIE  
15 BOARD.

16 Mr. Mullen indicated that he will inquire of the State  
17 Historic Preservation office their feeling on vinyl  
18 replacement. He stated they may say no way or they may  
19 decide that the historic integrity has already been  
20 damaged and that the replacement would not make it  
21 worse.

22 COMM. KARAZIM REMINDED THE COMMISSION THAT THEY DON'T  
23 KNOW WHAT'S UNDERNEATH THE ALUMINUM.

24 COMM. BURCH INQUIRED IF THE HARDIE BOARD GOES ON THE  
25 SAME AS THE VINYL AND DOES IT HAVE TO BE PAINTED.

Mr. Jason Sawinski, someone in the audience waiting on a  
future decision, stated that it comes primed with color.

COMM. BURCH INQUIRED IF IT LASTS AS LONG AS THE PROPOSED  
VINYL.

Mr. Sawinski indicated that it would last even longer.

Ms. Tolliver indicated that she still wants to replace  
the windows, as well.

COMM. BURCH ADVISED HER THAT THERE ARE SOME LOCAL  
CONTRACTORS THAT WORK WELL WITH WOODEN WINDOWS.

25

1 COMM. HENK REMINDED THE COMMISSION THAT THEY HAVE SET A  
PRECEDENCE.

2

3 COMM. KARAZIM STATED THAT THE NEIGHBORHOOD VOTED AND  
4 FORMED A CHARTER AND THAT THE COMMISSION IS TO ENFORCE  
THE RULES OF THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR AND THAT THEY'RE  
5 PICKY ON MATERIALS, NO ALUMINUM OR VINYL.

6

7 Ms. Tolliver indicated that there are some homes in her  
neighborhood where the siding was replaced with vinyl.

8

9 COMM. KARAZIM INQUIRED IF THAT WAS RECENTLY.

10

11 Ms. Tolliver answered within the last few years.

12

13 COMM. KARAZIM ASKED FOR HER TO TELL THE COMMISSION WHO  
14 IT IS SO THEY CAN MAKE THEM TAKE IT OFF.

15

16 Ms. Tolliver stated that she isn't going to do that but  
there is vinyl on the homes.

17

18 Mr. Dettmer inquired of the Commission what the  
19 difference is between vinyl and Hardie Board.

20

21 COMM. KARAZIM INDICATED THAT, JUST LIKE THE WINDOWS, IF  
22 THEY CAN BE FIXED THE HOMEOWNER HAS TO FIX THEM AND THAT  
23 THE FEDERAL RULES DO NOT ALLOW VINYL OR FIBERGLASS.

24

25 Mr. Mullen reminded everyone that he will contact the  
Secretary of Interior and he feels that they will be in  
line with how the Commission feels.

17 COMM. KARAZIM STATED THAT THEY ARE MORE STRICT THAN THE  
COMMISSION.

18

19 THE CHAIRPERSON STATED THAT HE WOULD ENTERTAIN A MOTION.

20

21 COMM. KARAZIM MOTIONED TO DENY.

22

23 COMM. HENK SECONDED WITH THE CAVEAT THAT, UNLESS LANSING  
24 GIVES DIFFERENT DIRECTION.

25

26 COMM. KARAZIM AGREED.

27

28 THE CHAIRPERSON STATED MAYBE THEY COULD HAVE A  
29 TELEPHONIC MEETING OR DO IT WITH E-MAILS BUT CALLED FOR  
A VOTE.

30

31 VOTE: AYES: Comm. David, Comm. Karazim,

1 Comm. Porter, Comm. Henk

2 NAYS: Comm. Burch

3  
4 ABSTAIN: None.

5 Vote 4-1-0 motion carries.

6 Mr. Mullen advised the homeowner that she can appeal with  
7 the Circuit Court.

8 REPLACEMENT OF ALL EXISTING WINDOWS AND ROOF REPLACEMENT  
9 HDC 18-07

10 PROPERTY ADDRESS: 263 Chippewa Drive

11 HISTORIC DISTRICT: Seminole Hills Historic District

12 PARCEL NO.: 64-14-31-252-010

13 APPLICANT: Terry Harrington  
14 Rep: Jason Sawinski

15 OWNER: Terry Harrington

16 Presentation of facts given by Mr. Mullen.

17 COMM. BURCH INQUIRED HOW LONG AGO THE WINDOWS WERE LAST  
18 REPLACED.

19 Mr. Mullen answered 2004 or earlier and stated that he  
20 now wants to replace with fiberglass.

21 Mr. Sawinski stated that the material is shiny and looks  
22 like clad.

23 COMM. HENK STATED THAT FIBERGLAS IS NOT STANDARD ON  
24 WINDOWS.

25 COMM. KARAZIM INQUIRED ABOUT THE YEAR THE HOUSE WAS  
BUILT.

Mr. Mullen answered that he wasn't able to find it but  
it was built post-war.

COMM. KARAZIM INQUIRED WHICH WAR.

1 Mr. Mullen answered World War II.

2 COMM. KARAZIM ADVISED THAT THERE ARE POST-WORLD WAR I  
3 HOMES AS WELL IN PONTIAC'S HISTORIC DISTRICTS.

4 Mr. Mullen advised the Commission that, since the  
5 historical integrity is gone, that they should allow  
6 this replacement.

7 COMM. BURCH DISAGREED.

8 COMM. KARAZIM DISAGREED AS WELL.

9 COMM. HENK STATED THAT THEY JUST TOLD A LADY SHE CANNOT  
10 PUT VINYL SIDING ON HER HOME SO THEY SHOULDN'T ALLOW  
11 THIS EITHER.

12 Mr. Mullen indicated that all the historic material is  
13 gone.

14 COMM. HENK STATED THAT THAT IS THE POINT, THAT THEY HAVE  
15 TO BRING IT BACK TO HISTORIC.

16 Mr. Mullen indicated that the Secretary of Interior  
17 standards state that you cannot have faux history.

18 COMM. HENK AGAIN ASKED HOW THEY CAN TELL THE PREVIOUS  
19 WOMAN THAT SHE NEEDS TO BRING HER HOME BACK TO HISTORIC  
20 AND NOT THIS ONE.

21 Mr. Mullen stated that she is comparing apples to  
22 oranges, that there is no historic history and that fake  
23 history is not allowed.

24 COMM. HENK DISAGREED AND STATED THAT THE HOMES SHOULD BE  
25 BROUGHT BACK TO THE HISTORIC CHARACTER.

26 COMM. PORTER SUGGESTED THAT THEY SHOULD FIND PICTURES OF  
27 THE ORIGINAL HOME AND MATCH IT AS BEST THEY CAN.

28 COMM. HENK AGREED.

29 COMM KARAZIM MOTIONED THAT THEY SHOULD FIND AN ORIGINAL  
30 PHOTO OF THE HOUSE AND MATCH IT WITH WOOD WITH 4 OVER 1  
31 OR 6 OVER 1 WOOD, TWO DIVIDES, OR ALUMINUM CLAD.

32 COMM. BURCH SECONDED.

33 VOTE: AYES: Comm. David, Comm. Karazim,



1 Comm. Porter, Comm. Henk, Comm. Burch

2 NAYS: None

3 ABSTAIN: None.

4 Vote 5-0-0 motion carries.

5 REPLACEMENT OF SEVEN DOUBLE-HUNG WINDOWS.

6 HDC 18-08

7 PROPERTY ADDRESS: 251 Ottawa Drive

8 HISTORIC DISTRICT: Seminole Hills Historic District

9 PARCEL NO.: 64-14-31-233-013

10 APPLICANT: Performance Residential Remodeling  
Rep: (Unidentified)

11 OWNER: John Bullis

12 Presentation of facts given by Mr. Mullen.

13 COMM. KARAZIM ADVISED THE APPLICANT THAT ONLY THE FRONT  
14 OF THE HOME THE COMMISSION IS PICKY ABOUT AND THAT THEY  
15 CAN PUT WHATEVER THEY WANT ON THE OTHER THREE SIDES.

16 Mr. Bullis stated that his living room has windows on  
17 the front and two sides and he would like them to match  
18 and he said the problem with repairing the single-pane  
19 windows is he is tired of having \$300 per month heating  
20 bills and the windows do not go up and down easily  
21 anymore.

22 COMM. KARAZIM MOTIONED TO ALLOW HIM TO DO WHATEVER HE  
23 WANTS WITH THE OTHER THREE SIDES OF THE HOUSE BUT THE  
24 FRONT SHOULD BE REPLACED WITH ALUMINUM CLAD TRUE DIVIDE.

25 Mr. Bullis stated that what he's picked out is a step up  
from aluminum clad.

MS. HENK SECONDED.

VOTE: AYES: Comm. David, Comm. Karazim,  
Comm. Porter, Comm. Henk, Comm. Burch

NAYS: None

1           ABSTAIN: None.

2   Vote 5-0-0 motion carries

3   PROPOSED FENCE IN SIDE YARD SETBACK

4   HDC 18-09

5   PROPERTY ADDRESS:   221 Chippewa Road

6   HISTORIC DISTRICT:   Seminole Hills Historic District

7   PARCEL NO.:           64-14-31-252-001

8   APPLICANT:           Mark Nguyen

9   OWNER:                Mark Nguyen

10   Presentation of facts given by Mr. Mullen.

11   COMM. KARAZIM INQUIRED IF THE FENCE WOULD BE FACING A  
12   STREET.

13   Mr. Nguyen answered that it would face the side street.

14   COMM. KARAZIM MOTIONED TO APPROVE.

15   COMM. HENK SECONDED.

16   VOTE:   AYES:        Comm. David, Comm. Karazim,  
                          Comm. Henk, Comm. Burch

17           NAYS:        None

18           ABSENT:   Comm. Porter

19   Vote 4-0-0 motion carries.

20   COMM. KARAZIM MOVED TO ADJOURN.

21   THE CHAIRPERSON SECONDED.

22   ADJOURNMENT:   7:49 p.m.

23

24

25

