

**SAGINAW CHARTER TOWNSHIP PLANNING COMMISSION
SAGINAW CHARTER TOWNSHIP HALL
NOVEMBER 20, 2013**

Members Present

P. Brucker
J. Egbert
B. Gombar
J. Howell
B. Nelson
C. Nolan
M. Peterson

Members Absent

Others Present

T. Gnatkowski, Planning Asst.
M. Mahlberg, Attorney
C. Edlinger, Recording Secretary

Mr. Brucker called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

Approval of Minutes:

Motion by Mr. Nelson, supported by Mr. Gombar, to approve the minutes of November 6, 2013.

VOTE: 7 YEAS 0 NAYS 0 ABSENT MOTION CARRIED

New Business:

- A. S-13-21 and SUP-13-05 –** Saginaw Senior Care of Saginaw, Michigan is requesting a special use permit and site plan approval to construct an additional parking lot of approximately 22 spaces, south and adjacent to the existing parking lot of Saginaw Senior Care, along with modifications located on the northeast corner of Weiss and Mackinaw at 4322 Mackinaw.

Mr. Gnatkowski stated Saginaw Senior Care is requesting a special use permit and site plan approval to construct an additional parking lot containing twenty-two (22) parking spaces. The project proposes to expand the assisted living facilities parking lot to the now vacant parcel to the south. This parcel, at the northeast corner of Weiss and Mackinaw, was residential. The dwelling was demolished at the end of October. Assisted living facilities are permitted after special use approval in residential districts.

The applicant is proposing this project to connect the existing parking lot with this parcel and construct an additional twenty-two (22) parking spaces. The expanded parking area is located on a residentially zoned parcel, located south and adjacent to the Saginaw Senior Care

development. This use is classified as an institutional use and is permitted in the R-1A zoning district as a special use. There are no new curb cuts to public roads as part of this parking expansion. All access to the new parking lot will be provided internally.

Whereas the proposed development renovation is a special use in a R-1A residential zoning district and the project complies with the general development standards of the Township; staff recommends approval of special use permit SUP-13-05 and of site plan S-13-21 with the nine (9) conditions listed in staff's report.

Mr. Jim Klein, engineer with Axiom Consulting Services along with Mike Kelly, a representative from Saginaw Senior Care, was present to answer any questions. Mr. Klein stated they have no problems with the conditions listed in staff's report. Mr. Gombar inquired about why they decided to expand their parking lot in that location as opposed to the rear of the property. Mr. Kelly explained how the previous owner approached Saginaw Senior Care regarding purchasing their property. Saginaw Senior Care purchased the property and then proceeded to demolish the existing residential house in anticipation of converting that area for a future parking expansion.

Mr. Brucker then asked for public comments in favor or in opposition to the proposed site plan.

There being no comments, Mr. Brucker closed the public hearing portion of the proposed site plan.

Discussion followed among the Planning Commission members.

Motion by Mr. Gombar, supported by Mr. Nelson, to recommend approval of the proposed special use permit (SUP-13-05) with the nine (9) conditions listed below:

1. Approval of a final site plan by the Community Development Department, Fire Department, Building Department and the Department of Public Services.
2. A Storm Water Management Plan will need to be reviewed and approved by the Township Engineer prior to the issuance of a building permit. Additional care shall be taken to address any existing storm water issues at the adjacent residential site which may have been exacerbated due to the substantial grade difference.
3. The owner, engineer, staff and the adjoining residential property owner will meet on site to discuss and finalize details regarding final landscaping.
4. Final landscaping plan including a minimum of ten street trees total (retained trees on site will count toward these requirements). The landscaping plan should reflect the screening and buffering requirements per the meeting with the Township and adjacent resident.
5. On-site lighting shall not exceed fifteen-feet (15') in height and the lighting plan shall meet the requirements of Section 409.

6. Dumpster loading/unloading shall take place after 7:00 am so as not to violate the Township's noise ordinance.
7. Parking in the areas directly adjacent to the residential areas should be so arranged so that third shift employees are provided alternative areas in which to park.
8. Employee break areas should be monitored so as not to occur adjacent to the residential areas, especially at night.
9. The proposed parking area should be combined through a land enhancement/land division application with the Saginaw Senior Care property.

VOTE: 7 YEAS 0 NAYS 0 ABSENT MOTION CARRIED

Motion by Mr. Gombar, supported by Mr. Nolan, to recommend approval of the proposed site plan (S-13-21) with the nine (9) conditions listed above.

VOTE: 7 YEAS 0 NAYS 0 ABSENT MOTION CARRIED

- B. Z-13-03 – Saginaw Charter Township of Saginaw, Michigan is requesting the adoption of the State Street Corridor standards and guidelines.**

Mr. Brucker addressed the public to inquire if there was anyone present whom had not attended the first public meeting held at Saginaw Charter Township Fire Station Three on October 16, 2013 regarding the proposed State Street Corridor standards and guidelines. There was no new public in attendance who had not attended the October meeting so Mr. Brucker closed the public hearing portion of the proposed text amendment.

Discussion followed among the Planning Commission members.

Motion by Mr. Nelson, supported by Mr. Nolan, to recommend approval of the proposed text amendment (Z-13-03) to the Township Board.

Proposed Amendment

Amend Chapter 3, Section 314, to add text as number 8 and renumber the current number 8 to 9 of the general design guidelines:

Section 314. General design guidelines.

8. *State Street Corridor.* The State Street Corridor is a specified geographic area within Saginaw Charter Township stretching along and around the State Street Corridor and extending north and south on collector roads. The specific geographic area is the same as the State Street Corridor Improvement Authority.

- a. The State Street Corridor Overlay District is recommended in order to meet the following:
 - i. Preserve the unique character of the State Street Corridor.
 - ii. Complement the existing pattern of buildings. Development should rely on found character, not imported character. Structures should be designed and developed or redeveloped to complement architecture, mass and bulk of the area surrounding it.
 - iii. Enhance the pedestrian orientation of the State Street area and the Saginaw Township community and encourage streetscape design that is inviting and on a human scale as well as ensuring consistent pedestrian connections throughout the area.
 - iv. Communicate the community's vision for the State Street area.
- b. Scope. The standards outlined apply to all developments excluding single family and two family developments including:
 - i. All newly constructed buildings.
 - ii. All exterior building and improvements which require a building permit (only standards applicable to the changed element apply).
 - iii. Renovation of a structure that requires site plan review or administrative site plan review.
- c. Landscaping Standards:
 - i. Shredded, hardwood mulch, a minimum of three inches (3") in depth, should be placed in defined beds.
 - ii. All beds shall be defined with plastic or metal edging.
 - iii. Ground cover used in lieu of turf grasses in whole or in part shall be planted in such a manner as to present a finished appearance and reasonable complete coverage after one (1) complete growing season. A growing season is defined as May-November.
 - iv. Annual, plastic, or other non-living plant material shall not be considered acceptable to meet the landscaping requirements of the ordinance.
- d. East State Street (Hemmeter Road to City of Saginaw)

The standards for development in this area are designed to preserve and protect the strong residential neighborhoods in Saginaw Charter Township. This business district is intended to provide a visual and physical buffer from more intense commercial activity further west on State Street and to provide complimentary and needed services, office uses and development that is in appearance, cohesive and complimentary to the surrounding residential character. Stone shall be incorporated into the building or incorporated within a site as detailed in the State Street Corridor Design Guide.

- i. Building Placement
 - a. Front yard setback: The front yard setback shall be fifteen feet from the proposed right of way as determined by Section 303.2. Parking shall not be the dominant feature of the site.
 - b. Side yards shall be a minimum of ten-feet (10') inclusive of parking.
 - c. Rear yard setback inclusive of parking shall be a minimum of ten-feet (10') unless adjacent to a residential district. When adjacent to a residential district, the side and rear yard of a nonresidential use which abuts a residential district shall be landscaped to provide a visual screen between districts. The extent of the screening shall be based on the distance between the parking area and/or the building to the property line, with the exception that the Planning Commission may require additional screening from parking areas and headlights if trespass by lighting or vehicle headlights is a concern:
 - i. Fifty (50') feet or more from building and/or parking area to the nearest residential property line, a buffer of maintained and seeded lawn is required along with one (1) tree or two (2) shrubs for each thirty (30') lineal feet.
 - ii. Thirty (30') feet but less than fifty (50') feet from building and/or parking area to the nearest residential property line, a buffer of maintained and seeded lawn or ground cover with three (3') foot tall berm with a slope no greater than three to one (3:1) with two (2) trees or four (4) shrubs installed within said buffer for each thirty (30') lineal feet.
 - iii. Fifteen (15') feet but less than thirty (30') feet from building and/or parking area to the nearest residential property line, an opaque fence six (6') feet in height with one (1) tree or two (2) shrubs shall be planted every thirty (30') lineal feet.
 - iv. A minimum of ten (10') feet but less than fifteen (15') feet from building and/or parking area to the nearest residential property line, a buffer screen no less than five (5') feet in width and six (6') feet in height shall be established, consisting of tree plantings, hedges, and an opaque fence or wall that is consistent with the materials and colors used on site.
- ii. Building Design Guidelines. For all new buildings or redevelopments:
 - a. Building facades are considered the public faces of buildings. All four (4) sides of the building must be addressed with consistent architecture.

- b. All buildings should have a “porch” or other such entrance that functions as a porch. It shall be a minimum of five (5’) feet wide.
 - c. Building owners are encouraged to place planters and window boxes with flowers or climbing vines within twelve (12”) inches of the building façade and plantings along the private walk leading to their “front door.”
 - d. All mechanical equipment, including roof top equipment, shall be screened from view.
 - e. Accessory structures are permitted however; they must be consistent in architecture and size and mass with the principal building.
- iii. Articulation and Fenestration
 - a. Each entry shall be the primary focus of the building.
 - b. Windows should be used in such a way as to provide visual interest to the building as a whole as well as to pedestrians. Banding of windows on second floors is encouraged.
 - iv. Windows and Transparency
 - a. Windows shall be clear, not tinted, mirrored or frosted, except that specialty windows (stained, etched, or other such similar treatments) are permitted at a maximum of one (1) per façade face.
 - b. Privacy can be achieved through the use of curtains or screening in appropriate locations, however, each business shall have a minimum of 50% of the store front windows “active” with displays, painted signage (limited to 80% of the window) or other such similar effect.
 - v. Roof type. A minimum 6/12 pitched roof is preferred and structures that provide for two (2) roof elevations (structure and porch) are encouraged.
 - vi. Materials. Natural materials, such as natural brick and stone, are encouraged.
 - vii. Entry
 - a. Entry ways shall be the primary focus of all buildings.
 - b. Functional doorways should be included in the rear of the building so that necessary loading and unloading can take place.
 - viii. Height
 - a. All new buildings shall have a minimum height of eighteen (18’) feet.
 - b. No building shall be greater than two stories or twenty-seven (27’) feet, except that structural appurtenances shall be permitted to exceed the height limitations when they are ornamental in purpose, such as steeples, belfries, cupolas, ornamental towers provide that such structural elements do not exceed twenty (20%) percent of the roof area.
- e. Streetscape Design Guidelines. All new developments and redevelopments shall require installation of streetscape design elements; either two elements from Option A or one element from Option B. All elements must be maintained in

perpetuity and of a type and style specifically approved by the Planning Commission.

Option A (choose two):

- Low (twelve inches to three feet in height) fence and landscaping
- Bench
- Potted plants

Option B (choose one):

- Stone knee wall (minimum 12 feet in length)
- Stone columns (2) with minimum ten(10') feet of fencing
- Stone columns (2) with associated landscaping

f. West State Street. The standards for this section of State Street are meant to permit a wide variety of more intense commercial and multiple family housing developments. The Township acknowledges that this level of intense development typically requires more parking, flexibility in parking standards and creative ways to screen parking and encourage pedestrians. Stone shall be incorporated into the building or incorporated within a site through the placement of large stones and outcroppings or as otherwise approved by the Planning Commission.

i. Building Placement

a. Front yard setback: The front yard setback shall be thirty (30') feet from the proposed right of way as determined by Section 303.2.

unless the applicant seeks one of the alternatives detailed below:

i. For a setback a minimum of 30 feet but more than 20 feet; the applicant may choose one (1) of the following elements:

- a. Stone columns and fencing
- b. Fencing (no less than 20 lineal feet) and a coordinated approved landscaping plan
- c. Stone columns at key entrances with coordinated and approved landscaping

ii. For a setback less than 20 feet but more than 10 feet; the applicant may choose one from each of the following groups:

- a. Group 1:
 - i. Stone columns and fencing
 - ii. Fencing (no less than 20 lineal feet) and a coordinated approved landscaping plan
 - iii. Stone columns at key entrances with coordinated and approved landscaping
- b. Group 2:

- i. Bench as approved by the Planning Commission
 - ii. Two planters maintained with plantings, as approved by the Planning Commission
 - iii. Trash can as approved by the Planning Commission
 - iii. For a setback less than 10 feet but at least five feet; the applicant may choose any four elements from the list below:
 - a. Stone columns at key locations with an approved associated landscaping plan
 - b. Fencing with associated landscaping as approved by the Planning Commission
 - c. Street trees planted in grates with an expanded sidewalk
 - d. A knee wall of decorative stone, at key locations, at least twelve feet in length
 - e. A bench and trash can as approved by the Planning Commission
 - f. Planters (maintained with plantings) at key locations as approved by the Planning Commission
 - g. Public art, as specifically approved by the Planning Commission, to be maintained in perpetuity
 - h. A quasi, outdoor/public space, at least four hundred square feet in size, as approved by the Planning Commission
- b. Parking shall not be the dominant feature of the site.
- c. Side yards are not required unless adjacent to residential development. Parking lots shall provide a minimum five (5') foot separation unless there is an executed mutual access easement agreement.
- d. Rear yard setback is thirty (30') feet, excluding parking which shall be a minimum of five feet (5') unless adjacent to a residential district. When adjacent to a residential district, the side and rear yard of a nonresidential use which abuts a residential district shall be landscaped to provide a visual screen between districts. The extent of the screening shall be based on the distance between the parking area and/or the building to the property line, with the exception that the Planning Commission may require additional screening from parking areas and headlights if trespass by lighting or vehicle headlights is a concern:
 - i. Fifty (50') feet or more from building and/or parking area to the nearest residential property line, a buffer of maintained and seeded lawn is required along with one (1) tree or two (2) shrubs for each thirty (30') lineal feet.

- ii. Thirty (30') feet but less than fifty (50') feet from building and/or parking area to the nearest residential property line, a buffer of maintained and seeded lawn or ground cover with three (3) foot tall berm with a slope no greater than three to one (3:1) with two (2) trees or four (4) shrubs installed within said buffer for each thirty (30') lineal feet.
 - iii. Fifteen (15') feet but less than thirty (30') feet from building and/or parking area to the nearest residential property line, an opaque fence six (6') feet in height with one (1) tree or two (2) shrubs shall be planted every thirty (30') lineal feet.
 - iv. A minimum of ten (10') feet but less than fifteen (15') feet from building and/or parking area to the nearest residential property line, a buffer screen no less than five (5') feet in width and six (6') feet in height shall be established, consisting of tree plantings, hedges, and an opaque fence or wall that is consistent with the materials and colors used on site.
- ii. Building Design Guidelines. For all new buildings or redevelopments:
 - a. Building facades are considered the public faces of buildings. All four sides of the building must be addressed with consistent architecture.
 - b. Walls greater than fifty (50') feet in length shall be effectively broken down through a change in surface, a change in materials or additional landscaping so as to reduce the perceived scale and mass of the wall.
 - c. All mechanical equipment, including roof top equipment, shall be screened from view.
 - d. Planters with landscaping are encouraged at key locations at and around the primary entrance to the building.
- iii. Articulation.
 - a. Each entry shall be the primary focus of the building.
 - b. Windows should be used in such a way as to provide visual interest to the building as a whole as well as to pedestrians.
 - c. Large scale developments, such as strip malls and shopping centers are required to provide a façade and design that allows distinctions between individual storefronts.
- iv. Windows and Transparency
 - a. The front façade of a structure shall be a minimum of forty (40%) percent transparent, meaning a combination of doors and windows. Windows shall be clear, not tinted, mirrored or frosted, except that specialty windows (stained, etched, or other such similar treatments) are permitted at a maximum of one (1) per façade face.
 - b. Care should be taken to place windows around the perimeter of the building unless not feasible due to interior layout or use. If the installation of windows is deemed not feasible by both the

- developer and the Zoning Administrator, additional architectural and/or landscaping detail is required along said façade.
- v. Roof type. There is no specific type of required roof type or pitch, except that creativity and quality design is encouraged. Large scale developments, such as strip malls and shopping centers are required to provide a façade and overall design that allows distinction between and among individual storefronts.
 - vi. Materials. Natural materials, such as natural brick and stone, are encouraged. Manmade materials are discouraged, especially on the first floors. Color schemes should be selected that enhance and compliment the materials selected.
 - vii. Entry
 - a. Entry ways shall be the primary focus of all buildings.
 - b. Functional doorways shall be included along storefronts and other developments whenever possible.
 - viii. Height. Buildings shall have a minimum height of eighteen (18') feet.
- g. Performance Standards. In order to permit a wide range of uses and provide for creativity and flexibility for developers and the Township, while still preserving the character and identity of Saginaw Charter Township, the following performance standards shall apply to all uses within the State Street Corridor:
- i. All outdoor lighting shall be limited to 15 feet in height when located 300 feet from a residentially zoned district. Fixtures should be of a "cut off" type and there should be zero foot candles measured at the property lines.
 - ii. Dumpster unloading, parking lot cleaning, and similar building or site maintenance shall not take place before 7:00 a.m. nor after 10:00 p.m., excepting that snow plowing is permitted during all hours.
 - iii. No use is permitted which creates a noise level greater than which is allowed in by the noise ordinance when measured from the nearest residential property line. The Planning Commission may require details of operation and a map showing the areas affected by potential noise.
 - iv. No use is permitted which emits smoke, soot or noxious fumes or odors excepting smoke or odors which are typically associated with restaurants and food service establishments.
 - v. Emergency road and utility repairs, road cleaning, snow plowing and other such similar work conducted by the Township, County and/or its agents operated within the road or road right-of-way shall be exempt from these standards. Additionally, sirens used by public safety agencies are exempt as well.

- vi. Any use that evolves into a nuisance, resulting in police, fire or other such calls that exceeds by 50% similar uses in the Township, the property owner/operator shall be issued a civil infraction as permitted in the Township's General Ordinance.

VOTE: 7 YEAS 0 NAYS 0 ABSENT MOTION CARRIED

Receive and File All Correspondence:

- A. A copy of the September 2013 issue of Planning & Zoning News.

Other New Business:

Adjournment:

Motion by Mr. Howell, supported by Ms. Egbert, to adjourn the meeting at 7:17 p.m.

VOTE: 7 YEAS 0 NAYS 0 ABSENT MOTION CARRIED